

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Friday, October 9, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Jane Long; Dr. Linda Rudolph, Dr. Gina Solomon, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman.

Also Present: None.

2. COMMENDATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/AWARDS

The Council recognized Professor Severin Borenstein, for his service, leadership, and dedication to protecting air quality in the Bay Area. On behalf of the Board, Board Chair Sinks thanked Professor Borenstein for bringing an economist's perspective to Council deliberations on Particulate Matter reduction strategies.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JULY 31, 2020

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Dr. Rudolph made a motion, seconded by Dr. Solomon, to **approve** the Minutes of July 31, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Lipman, Rudolph, Sinks, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: Long.
ABSENT: Kleinman.

4. DELIBERATION ON PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) STRATEGY

The Council continued its deliberations on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region and potential recommended measures to further protect public health. The Council refined a list of findings and potential strategies to reduce Particulate Matter that will be presented to the Air District's Board of Directors at the end of the year.

The Council recessed at 10:50 a.m. and resumed at 11:03 a.m.

Chair Hayes gave the presentation *Particulate Matter Strategy Report*, including: final report; Appendix A: Supplemental Information; and Appendix B: Symposium Summaries, Presentation, and Additional Information.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Dr. Stephen Rosenblum, Palo Alto resident; Dan Sakaguchi; and Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether there is evidence of a health effects PM_{2.5} threshold; how health protective more stringent PM_{2.5} standards might be; the feasibility of the Air District setting a Bay Area target below the current PM_{2.5} National Ambient Air Quality Standards, perhaps as low as 10 or 8 ug/m³; How to account for wildfire PM exposure, over time; the suggestion of referencing the United States Environmental Protection Agency's definitions when using certain terms, such as "sensitive population"; the need to make PM speciation data available to the public; the need for increased monitoring of ultrafine particles on a national scale and the study of their health impacts; appealing to federal and state agencies who have regulatory authority the Air District lacks to set more stringent PM standards; the need for the expansion of community-level exposure and health impact assessments; the PM impacts of the transition to electrification from fossil fuels by bridging the gap with natural gas; the Board's request that the Council provides input on the tradeoffs between wet and dry scrubbing technology to reduce PM in the Bay Area; the ability of the Air District to set "standards" vs "targets"; and whether public comments should be heard before or after Council deliberation.

Chair Hayes said that Council members would be individually sent the revised Findings and Potential Recommendations list, and that Council members had until October 16 to submit comments to Air District staff. Deliberations will continue at the upcoming Council meeting.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT**

Chair Hayes had nothing to report.

6. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER**

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, thanked the Council members for their time and contributions to the ongoing Particulate Matter deliberation.

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Public comments received via electronic mail, and read aloud by Vanessa Johnson, Manager of Executive Operations, were submitted by Charles Davidson, Hercules resident.

8. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

9. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, November 9, 2020 at 9:00 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 1:20 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards